

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction to Immigration Economics</b>	1
1.1	The Late Twentieth Century Immigration Explosion	2
1.1.1	The Complexity of Immigration	3
1.1.2	Not Everyone Likes Immigrants	4
1.1.3	Economists' Perspective	5
1.2	The Determinants of Immigration	6
1.2.1	Many Factors Discourage Immigration	6
1.2.2	Considering the Full Set of Push, Pull, Stay, and Stay Away Factors	9
1.2.3	Recent Shifts in the Economic Forces that Influence Immigration	9
1.2.4	Immigration is a Complex Phenomenon	10
1.3	A Brief History of Immigration	10
1.3.1	Early Migrations	11
1.3.2	Recent Immigration	12
1.4	There are Many Types of Immigrants	14
1.4.1	Not All Immigrants are Permanent Settlers	14
1.4.2	Forced Immigration	15
1.4.3	Some Immigrants are Difficult to Classify	16
1.5	The Purpose and Organization of this Book	16
	References	18

## Part I Immigration Theory and Evidence

<b>2</b>	<b>The Determinants of International Migration: Theory</b>	27
	Chapter Overview	27
2.1	The Theory of Internal Migration	29
2.1.1	Pre-1960 Theory	29
2.1.2	Ravenstein and Zipf	30
2.1.3	The Modern Theory of Internal Migration	31
2.1.4	Further Influences on Internal Migration	37
2.2	The Economic Theory of Immigration	39
2.2.1	The First Borjas Model	39
2.2.2	Borjas' 1991 Model	46

- 2.2.3 Recent Extensions of the Borjas Model ..... 47
- 2.3 The Family or Household as the Decision-Making Unit ..... 51
  - 2.3.1 Conflicting Interests and the Family Migration Decision .... 52
  - 2.3.2 Mincer’s Model ..... 52
  - 2.3.3 Family Migration as a Portfolio Decision ..... 53
- 2.4 Summary and Conclusions ..... 53
- References ..... 54
  
- 3 Why People Immigrate: The Evidence ..... 59**
  - Chapter Overview ..... 59
  - 3.1 Regression Models of Immigration ..... 60
    - 3.1.1 Empirical Models of Regional Migration ..... 60
    - 3.1.2 The Gravity Model of International Migration ..... 61
    - 3.1.3 Some Econometric Problems Related  
to the Gravity Model ..... 64
  - 3.2 The Choice of Variables in Statistical Models of Immigration ..... 65
    - 3.2.1 Three Examples ..... 66
    - 3.2.2 Representing Income Differences ..... 66
    - 3.2.3 Representing Migration Costs ..... 66
    - 3.2.4 Representing Source Country Development ..... 67
    - 3.2.5 Representing Immigration Restrictions ..... 68
  - 3.3 The Empirical Evidence on the Determinants of Migration ..... 69
    - 3.3.1 Evidence on Worldwide Migration ..... 69
    - 3.3.2 Evidence on Migration to Groups of OECD Countries ..... 70
    - 3.3.3 Evidence on U.S. Immigration ..... 70
    - 3.3.4 Immigration to Other Countries ..... 71
    - 3.3.5 Summarizing the Results ..... 72
  - 3.4 Summary and Concluding Remarks ..... 74
    - 3.4.1 The Power of Statistical Models ..... 74
    - 3.4.2 The Way Forward ..... 75
  - References ..... 76
  
- 4 Who Immigrates? Theory and Evidence ..... 79**
  - Chapter Overview ..... 79
  - 4.1 Immigrant Selection: The Chiswick Vs. Borjas Debate ..... 81
    - 4.1.1 Some Unfortunate Terminology ..... 82
    - 4.1.2 The Chiswick View ..... 82
    - 4.1.3 The Borjas Model ..... 84
    - 4.1.4 A More Detailed Look at the Borjas Model ..... 86
    - 4.1.5 Selection by Observed Characteristics ..... 88
  - 4.2 Extensions of the Borjas Model ..... 88
    - 4.2.1 Variable Migration Costs and Migrant Selection ..... 88
    - 4.2.2 Credit Constraints and Immigrant Selection ..... 90
    - 4.2.3 Family Migration and Selection Bias ..... 91
  - 4.3 The Empirical Evidence on Immigrant Selectivity ..... 93

- 4.3.1 Borjas' Empirical Results ..... 93
- 4.3.2 Further Tests of Borjas' Model ..... 94
- 4.3.3 Tests Based on Counterfactual Density Functions ..... 95
- 4.4 The Asymmetric Information Model ..... 96
  - 4.4.1 Kwok and Leland's Model ..... 96
  - 4.4.2 Restoring Symmetric Information ..... 98
- 4.5 The Theory of Immigrant Assimilation ..... 98
  - 4.5.1 The Chiswick Study of Assimilation ..... 99
  - 4.5.2 Potential Bias in Chiswick's Results ..... 100
  - 4.5.3 Borjas' Empirical Results ..... 101
- 4.6 Addressing Borjas' Critique ..... 102
- 4.7 Conclusions ..... 104
- References ..... 105

**5 The Effects of Immigration on the Destination Economy:**

- The Theory** ..... 107
- Chapter Overview ..... 107
- 5.1 The Macro Effects of Immigration ..... 108
  - 5.1.1 Homogeneous Labor with Fixed Capital ..... 108
  - 5.1.2 Homogeneous Labor with Variable Capital ..... 112
  - 5.1.3 Heterogeneous Labor ..... 114
  - 5.1.4 Heterogeneous Labor with Constant Capital ..... 114
  - 5.1.5 Heterogeneous Labor and Perfectly Elastic Capital Supply ..... 115
  - 5.1.6 How Big is the U.S. Immigrant Surplus? ..... 115
- 5.2 Detailing the Distributional Effects of Immigration ..... 116
  - 5.2.1 The Johnson Model (1980) ..... 116
  - 5.2.2 The Altonji and Card Model (1991) ..... 117
  - 5.2.3 The Ottaviano and Peri Model ..... 118
- 5.3 Long-Run Adjustment Processes ..... 120
  - 5.3.1 Internal Migration Responses ..... 120
  - 5.3.2 Multiple Goods ..... 121
  - 5.3.3 Choice of Technology ..... 122
  - 5.3.4 The Demand Effect of Immigration ..... 122
- 5.4 The Demand Effect of Immigration ..... 122
  - 5.4.1 Say's Law of Immigration ..... 123
  - 5.4.2 Regional Migration and Local Demand ..... 124
  - 5.4.3 A Few Models of Immigrant Demand Effects ..... 125
  - 5.4.4 Bodvarsson and Van den Berg's Lexington Model ..... 126
  - 5.4.5 The More General Case ..... 127
  - 5.4.6 Further Models of Immigrant Demand Effects ..... 127
- 5.5 Concluding Remarks ..... 129
- References ..... 130

<b>6</b>	<b>How Immigration Impacts the Destination Economy:</b>	
	<b>The Evidence</b> .....	133
	Introduction .....	133
6.1	The Spatial Correlation Method .....	134
6.1.1	Cross Section Applications .....	135
6.1.2	Dealing with Simultaneity and Spurious Correlation .....	136
6.1.3	Recent Applications of the Spatial Correlation Method ...	139
6.1.4	Applications of the Unexpected Exogenous Supply Shock Method .....	141
6.1.5	The Mariel Boatlift .....	142
6.1.6	Russian Immigrants in Israel .....	144
6.1.7	Assessing the Spatial Correlation Method .....	146
6.2	The Production Function Method .....	146
6.2.1	Grossman's Pioneering Production Study .....	147
6.2.2	Gang and Rivera-Batiz .....	148
6.2.3	Assessing the Production Function Method .....	149
6.3	The Skill Cell Approach .....	150
6.3.1	Borjas' Use of National Data versus Regional Data .....	150
6.3.2	Ottaviano and Peri's Extension of Borjas' Skill Cell Model .....	152
6.3.3	Other Types of Labor Market Cells .....	154
6.4	Concluding Remarks .....	154
	References .....	155
<b>7</b>	<b>Estimating Immigration's Impact: Accounting for all Adjustments</b>	159
	Chapter Introduction .....	159
7.1	Does Immigration Trigger Internal Migration? .....	160
7.1.1	Evidence That Immigrants Drive out Natives .....	160
7.1.2	Evidence that Immigration has Little Effect on Native Migration .....	163
7.2	Migration Biases Estimates of Immigration's Wage Effect .....	164
7.3	Does Immigration Change Industry Structure? .....	166
7.4	Measuring the Demand Effects of Immigration .....	167
7.4.1	Hercowitz and Yashiv's Estimates .....	167
7.4.2	Bodvarsson and Van den Berg's Lexington, Nebraska, Study .....	169
7.4.3	Estimating the Demand Effect of the Mariel Boatlift .....	170
7.4.5	Additional Estimates of the Demand Effects of Immigration .....	172
7.6	The Costs of Government Services for Immigrants .....	173
7.6.1	Recent Studies for the United States .....	174
7.6.2	Are U.S. Immigrants More Costly Today than in the Past? .....	175
7.7	Immigration's External Effects .....	176
7.7.1	Economies of Scale .....	176

- 7.7.2 Are There Negative Externalities Associated with Immigration? ..... 178
- 7.8 Concluding Remarks ..... 179
- References ..... 180
- 8 Immigration and the Source Country ..... 183**
  - 8.1 Remittances and Demand Effects in the Source Country ..... 184
    - 8.1.1 Demand Effects ..... 184
    - 8.1.2 Immigrants and Remittances ..... 185
    - 8.1.3 A Two-Country View of Remittances ..... 186
  - 8.2 What We Know About Immigrant Remittances ..... 188
    - 8.2.1 The Growth of Immigrant Remittances ..... 188
    - 8.2.2 Remittances as a Percentage of Source Country GDP ..... 189
    - 8.2.3 The Reliability of Remittance Data ..... 190
    - 8.2.4 The Recent Data on the Growth of Immigrant Remittances ..... 190
    - 8.2.5 Policies to Encourage Remittances ..... 191
    - 8.2.6 How Remittances are used in the Source Countries ..... 193
    - 8.2.7 Remittances: Tentative Conclusions ..... 195
  - 8.3 Negative Externalities from Agglomeration ..... 195
    - 8.3.1 Economies of Scale, Agglomeration, and Source Countries ..... 196
    - 8.3.2 Agglomeration Causes the Source Countries to Shrink .... 197
  - 8.4 Immigration and Technology Transfers, Investment, and Trade .. 198
    - 8.4.1 Immigration and International Investment ..... 199
    - 8.4.2 Immigration and International Trade ..... 200
    - 8.4.3 Immigration and Services Trade ..... 200
  - 8.5 The Brain Drain ..... 201
    - 8.5.1 Human Capital of Immigrants ..... 201
    - 8.5.2 The Brain Drain as a Development Issue ..... 202
    - 8.5.3 How Big is the Brain Drain? ..... 203
    - 8.5.4 Why Human Capital Flees Capital-Scarce Countries ..... 209
    - 8.5.5 Brain Drain and Brain Waste ..... 210
  - 8.6 A Reassessment of the Brain Drain ..... 210
    - 8.6.1 Remittances Again ..... 211
    - 8.6.2 The Brain Drain as an Incentive to Seek Education ..... 211
  - 8.7 Conclusions ..... 216
  - References ..... 217
- 9 Economic Growth and Immigration ..... 221**
  - 9.1 The Early Models of Economic Growth ..... 222
    - 9.1.1 Adam Smith’s Broad View of Growth ..... 223
    - 9.1.2 The Classicals and Diminishing Returns ..... 224
    - 9.1.3 The Role of Immigration in the Classical Model ..... 226
    - 9.1.4 The Simplistic Harrod–Domar Growth Model ..... 226

- 9.2 The Solow Growth Model ..... 227
  - 9.2.1 A Graphic Representation of the Solow Model ..... 227
  - 9.2.2 Immigration Similarly has no Long-Run Effects ..... 229
  - 9.2.3 How an Economy Achieves Permanent Growth ..... 231
- 9.3 Immigration and Technological Progress ..... 232
  - 9.3.1 Immigration and Technological Progress ..... 233
  - 9.3.2 Joseph Schumpeter’s Theory of Creative Destruction ..... 233
  - 9.3.3 A Graphic Schumpeterian Model ..... 235
  - 9.3.4 The Opportunity Costs of Innovation ..... 236
  - 9.3.5 The Gains from Innovation ..... 238
  - 9.3.6 The Equilibrium Level of R&D Activity ..... 240
- 9.4 Immigration in the Schumpeterian Model ..... 241
  - 9.4.1 Immigrants as an Innovative Resource ..... 241
  - 9.4.2 Immigrants Increase the Returns to Innovation ..... 243
  - 9.4.3 Immigrants and Technology Transfers ..... 243
- 9.5 Protectionism, Creative Destruction, and Immigration ..... 246
  - 9.5.1 Creation Requires Destruction ..... 246
  - 9.5.2 The Holmes and Schmitz Model ..... 247
- 9.6 Growth Effects of Immigration in the Source Country ..... 248
  - 9.6.1 The Overall Growth Effect of Out-Migration ..... 248
  - 9.6.2 How Remittances are used in Source Countries ..... 249
- 9.7 The Brain Drain Again ..... 250
- 9.8 Summary and Conclusions ..... 251
- Appendix: An Alternative Mathematical Schumpeterian Model ..... 252
  - A.1 Innovation and Profit ..... 253
  - A.2 The Equilibrium Level of Entrepreneurial Activity ..... 254
  - A.3 The Equilibrium Rate of Technological Progress ..... 254
- References ..... 256

**Part II Immigration Issues and Cases**

- 10 Temporary Immigration, Involuntary Immigration, and Other Variations on the Standard Model ..... 261**
  - Chapter Overview ..... 261
  - 10.1 Return Immigration ..... 262
    - 10.1.1 Return Immigration as a Response to Changing Circumstances ..... 263
    - 10.1.2 Correcting Mistakes in Judgement ..... 264
    - 10.1.3 Source Country Policies to Encourage Immigrants to Return ..... 264
  - 10.2 Temporary Immigration ..... 264
    - 10.2.1 The Multinational Corporation and Temporary Immigration ..... 265

- 10.2.2 Temporary Immigration as a Destination
  - Country Policy ..... 266
- 10.2.3 The Diversity of Temporary Immigration ..... 267
- 10.3 Analyzing Temporary Migration ..... 268
  - 10.3.1 A Simple Model: Culture Clash
    - versus Higher Income ..... 268
  - 10.3.2 Other Determinants of Temporary Immigration ..... 270
  - 10.3.3 The Role of International Trade ..... 271
  - 10.3.4 Further Issues Related to Temporary Immigration ..... 272
  - 10.3.5 Growth Implications of Temporary Immigration ..... 273
  - 10.3.6 Temporary Immigration and the Ageing Problem ..... 274
- 10.4 Asylum Seekers and Refugees ..... 276
  - 10.4.1 Refugees ..... 277
  - 10.4.2 The UNHCR ..... 278
  - 10.4.3 Asylum Seekers ..... 278
- 10.5 Involuntary Immigration ..... 279
  - 10.5.1 A Model of International Slavery ..... 280
  - 10.5.2 Other Oppressive Forms of Immigration ..... 282
- 10.6 Summary and Conclusions ..... 283
- References ..... 284

- 11 Unauthorized Immigration ..... 287**
  - Introduction ..... 287
  - 11.1 Estimating Unauthorized Immigration ..... 289
    - 11.1.1 The Residual Method ..... 289
    - 11.1.2 Other Methods for Estimating Unauthorized
      - Immigration ..... 291
  - 11.2 How Many Unauthorized Immigrants are There? ..... 292
  - 11.3 Some Characteristics of Unauthorized Immigrants ..... 295
  - 11.4 The Economic Analysis of Unauthorized Immigration ..... 296
    - 11.4.1 The Supply and Demand for Unauthorized Workers .. 297
    - 11.4.2 Unauthorized Immigration as a Form of Labor Market
      - Discrimination ..... 299
    - 11.4.3 Oppression of Unauthorized Workers ..... 301
    - 11.4.4 Discussion of the Labor Segmentation Hypothesis .... 303
    - 11.4.5 Close Variations on Illegality ..... 304
    - 11.4.6 Unauthorized Immigration can be Deadly ..... 306
  - 11.5 The Fiscal Costs and Benefits of Unauthorized Immigration ... 307
  - 11.6 Unauthorized Immigration: Policy Options ..... 309
    - 11.6.1 Border Controls ..... 309
    - 11.6.2 Employer Sanctions ..... 310
  - 11.7 Conclusions ..... 311
  - References ..... 312

- 12 Hispanic Immigration to the United States** ..... 315
  - 12.1 The Characteristics of Hispanic Immigration ..... 317
  - 12.2 Assimilation ..... 320
    - 12.2.1 Hispanics’ Slow Assimilation ..... 320
    - 12.2.2 Further Reasons Why Hispanic Assimilation is Slow .. 325
    - 12.2.3 Perhaps It Is All a Data Problem ..... 327
    - 12.2.4 Political Attitudes of Hispanic Immigrants ..... 328
  - 12.3 Geographic Diffusion ..... 329
    - 12.3.1 Networks and Herding ..... 329
    - 12.3.2 Towards the South and the Midwest ..... 330
    - 12.3.3 The Dispersal of  
Manufacturing Jobs and Immigrant Dispersal ..... 332
  - 12.4 Explaining Hispanic Immigration ..... 334
    - 12.4.1 The Welfare Effects on the Source  
Hispanic Countries ..... 335
    - 12.4.2 The Demand Effects of Hispanic Immigration ..... 336
  - 12.5 Future Hispanic Immigration ..... 336
    - 12.5.1 Will Hispanic Immigration Continue? ..... 337
    - 12.5.2 Temporary Immigration Programs ..... 338
  - 12.6 Conclusions ..... 339
- References ..... 340

**Part III Immigration Policy: Introduction**

- 13 Immigration Policy in the United States** ..... 349
  - Chapter Overview ..... 349
  - 13.1 Early Immigration Policy ..... 352
    - 13.1.1 The Borders were not Entirely Open ..... 353
    - 13.1.2 Assessing the Early Policies ..... 353
  - 13.2 The Latter Half of the Nineteenth Century ..... 354
    - 13.2.1 Religion and Immigration ..... 354
    - 13.2.2 Growing Opposition to Immigration Spurs  
New Legislation ..... 355
    - 13.2.3 The Chinese Exclusion Act ..... 356
    - 13.2.4 Controlling the Border ..... 357
    - 13.2.5 Immigration Remained Mostly Open ..... 358
    - 13.2.6 Assessing the Early Policies ..... 359
  - 13.3 The Shift in Policy in the Early Twentieth Century ..... 360
    - 13.3.1 The First General Restrictions of Immigration ..... 360
    - 13.3.2 The Post-World War I Shift in Policy ..... 361
    - 13.3.3 Immigration During the Great Depression ..... 362
    - 13.3.4 Immigration Policy During the War ..... 364
  - 13.4 Post World War II Immigration Policy ..... 364
    - 13.4.1 Policy Immediately After the War ..... 364



13.4.2	A New Immigration Law in 1965 .....	365
13.4.3	The Economic Effects of the 1965 Act .....	366
13.4.4	The Growth of Unauthorized Immigration .....	367
13.5	Recent United States Immigration Policy .....	367
13.5.1	IRCA .....	368
13.5.2	After IRCA .....	369
13.5.3	Summarizing Recent U.S. Policy .....	370
13.6	Post 9/11 Immigration Policy .....	371
13.6.1	Reform of the Immigration Bureau- cracy and Enforcement .....	371
13.6.2	Employment-Based Permanent Residency .....	372
13.6.3	Temporary Work Visas .....	374
13.6.4	Immigration Reform Stalls in 2006 and 2007 .....	374
13.7	Summary and Conclusions .....	375
	References .....	377
<b>14</b>	<b>Immigration Policy in Canada .....</b>	<b>379</b>
	Chapter Overview .....	379
14.1	Overview of Immigration Policy in Canada .....	380
14.1.1	Overview of Immigration and Population Growth in Canada .....	380
14.1.2	The Early Years .....	382
14.1.3	Late Nineteenth Century Immigration .....	383
14.1.4	Summary of Nineteenth Century Canadian Immigration Policy .....	384
14.2	Canadian Immigration Policy in the Twentieth Century .....	385
14.2.1	The First Half of the Twentieth Century .....	385
14.2.2	After World War II .....	387
14.2.3	Comparing Immigration Legislation .....	388
14.3	Canada's Immigration Policy Today .....	389
14.3.1	The Canadian Point System .....	389
14.3.2	Should Policy Discriminate in Favor of Highly Educated Immigrants? .....	390
14.3.3	The Seven Questions in the Early Twenty First Century .....	392
14.4	Some Final Observations .....	393
	References .....	394
<b>15</b>	<b>Immigration Policy in Europe .....</b>	<b>395</b>
	Chapter Overview .....	395
15.1	European Migration During the Colonial Era .....	398
15.1.1	Colonial Regimes and Immigration .....	398
15.1.2	The Nineteenth Century .....	400
15.1.3	The Emigration Life Cycle .....	401
15.1.4	European Emigration After World War I .....	403

15.2	The Post-World War II Period .....	403
15.2.1	Guest Workers .....	404
15.2.2	The Post-Soviet Era .....	406
15.2.3	Recent EU Immigration Policy .....	407
15.3	The Interesting Case of Ireland .....	407
15.4	Recent Immigration Policy in Spain .....	410
15.6	Can Immigration Solve the Demographic Burden? .....	411
15.7	Conclusions .....	413
	References .....	413
<b>16</b>	<b>Conclusions and Final Observations .....</b>	<b>415</b>
	Chapter Overview .....	415
16.1	Immigration: A Fundamental Economic Phenomenon .....	416
16.2	We Must Think Outside our Little Boxes .....	418
16.3	An Appeal to Holism .....	420
16.3.1	Defining Holism .....	420
16.3.2	The Economics of Immigration Must Embrace Holism .....	421
16.3.3	The Holistic Approach to the Study of Immigration: An Example .....	422
16.4	Developing International Institutions for an International Phenomenon .....	425
16.4.1	The Global Commission on International Migration ...	425
16.4.2	What is the Optimal Flow of Immigrants? .....	426
16.4.3	Small Steps Towards Global Governance .....	427
16.5	Final Comment .....	428
	References .....	428